

DELEGATED REPORT

Application No:	P/23/0128
Site Address:	Llwyn-Yr-Eos House Llwyn-yr-eos Abercanaid Merthyr Tydfil CF48 1YR
Development:	Replace existing side extension roof with a flat roof and glass lantern, new bifold doors, new window to front of study and replacement widows to front elevation first and second floors and renew rendering
Case Officer:	Rebecca Owens
Site Visit:	25th May 2023
Application Expiry Date:	10th July 2023
Consultation reply date expired:	11th July 2023

APPLICATION SITE

The application relates to a Grade II listed detached dwelling, located in a predominantly residential area within the settlement boundary. At present, the dwelling is three storeys in height with a modest two storey rear annexe, centrally sited off its rear elevation. There is also a single storey side annexe and a single storey rear sunroom extension, which is adjacent to the southern side elevation of the two storey rear annexe.

PROPOSED DEVELOPMENT

Listed building consent is sought for the following works:

- Removal of the mono-pitched roof of an existing extension (which is mainly glass with a tiled section) and its replacement with a flat EPDM rubber roof which would be 2.84m in height. The roof would contain a glass lantern which would be 3.13m by 1.8m and which would project above the roof by 0.3m
- Removal of the existing timber windows and French doors in the south eastern facing side elevation of this extension and the insertion of new bifold powder coated aluminium doors.
- The existing window in the front elevation of the side annexe would be removed and the opening blocked up with a new larger window opening created more centrally within the elevation. This would be a hardwood timber window of a design to match the window in the front elevation.

- Replacement of the first and second floors windows in the front elevation with new white, hardwood sash windows.
- Renewal of the rendering

PLANNING HISTORY

There is no relevant planning history which needs to be taken into consideration when determining this application.

CONSULTATION

The following bodies were consulted and their responses are presented below:

CADW	No response
Glamorgan Gwent Archaeological Trust	No objection
Civic Trust for Wales	No response
Royal Commission of the Ancient and Historical Monuments of Wales	No response
Society for the Protection of Ancient Buildings	No response
The Victorian Society	No response
Merthyr Tydfil Heritage Trust	No response

PUBLICITY

In accordance with the Town & Country Planning (Development Management Procedure) (Wales) Order 2012, letters were sent to neighbouring properties, a site notice was displayed within the vicinity of the site and a notice was published in the local newspaper.

No letters of objection were received following this publicity exercise.

POLICY CONTEXT

National Development Framework

Future Wales: the National Plan 2040 (February 2021) sets out a strategy for addressing key national priorities through the planning system, including sustaining and developing a vibrant economy, achieving decarbonisation and climate-resilience, developing strong ecosystems and improving the health and well-being of our communities.

National Planning Policies

Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990:

Paragraph 16. – *“(1) Subject to the previous provision of this Part, the local planning authority or, as the case may be, the Secretary of State may grant or refuse an application for listed building consent and, if they grant consent, may grant it subject to conditions.*

(2) In considering whether to grant listed building consent for any works the local planning authority or the Secretary of State shall have special regard to the desirability of preserving the building or its setting or any features of special architectural or historic interest which it possesses.

(3) Any listed building consent shall (except in so far as it otherwise provides) ensure for the benefit of the building and of all persons for the time being interested in it”.

Section 66. - (1)In considering whether to grant planning permission or permission in principle for development which affects a listed building or its setting, the local planning authority or, as the case may be, the Secretary of State shall have special regard to the desirability of preserving the building or its setting or any features of special architectural or historic interest which it possesses.

(2)Without prejudice to section 72, in the exercise of the powers of appropriation, disposal and development (including redevelopment) conferred by the provisions of sections 232, 233 and 235(1) of the principal Act, a local authority shall have regard to the desirability of preserving features of special architectural or historic interest, and in particular, listed buildings.

Welsh Office Circular 61/96: Planning the Historic Environment: Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas

Part 1 Paragraph 11 requires local planning authorities considering applications for works which affect listed buildings to have special regard to its character and setting.

Planning Policy Wales (Edition 11, February 2021)

Section 6.1 recognises the importance of protecting the historic environment and paragraph 6.1.10 states that *‘For any development proposal affecting a listed building or its setting, the primary material consideration is the statutory requirement to have special regard to the desirability of preserving the building, its setting or any features of special architectural or historic interest which it possesses.’*

Technical Advice Note 24: The Historic Environment (2017) is also of relevance.

- Chapter 5 paragraphs 5.9-5.17 provide detailed guidance on listed building consent.
- Paragraph 6.3 states that local planning authorities must give special attention to the desirability of preserving or enhancing conservation areas when taking planning decisions. Whilst in relation to town centres paragraph 6.6 places an emphasis on controlled and positive management of change that encourages economic vibrancy and social and cultural vitality, and accords with the area’s special architectural and historic qualities.

Local Planning Policies

The following policies of the Merthyr Tydfil County Borough Council Replacement Local Development Plan 2016-2031 are relevant to the determination of this application:

- SW11 Sustainable Design and Placemaking
- CW1 Historic Environment

PLANNING CONSIDERATIONS

The main issue to consider under this application relates to the effect of the works on the character and appearance of the listed building.

The proposed works involve the removal of the existing mono-pitched roof over the sunroom and its replacement with a flat roof. This would include a large roof light which would project above it and would be sited in an off centre position. The Heritage Impact Assessment submitted with this application indicates that this is required due to the poor condition of the existing roof, which leaks and emits heat. It also notes that the introduction of a slate roof was explored but the minimum pitch required for this would impact on the first floor window and thus a flat roof was proposed. Whilst this is acknowledged, it is not considered that the introduction of a flat rubber roof preserves or enhances the listed building. In addition, the off centre, modern roof light is also considered to be in contrast with the traditional character of the building and thus would appear discordant and anomalous. Similarly, the replacement of the existing French doors and timber windows with aluminium bi-folding doors is considered to be an unacceptable alteration which would replace more traditional wooden fenestration (although it is noted the doors are upvc) with doors that are a very modern alternative and in contrast to the existing, fenestration of the building. Whilst it is recognised that the above alterations are proposed to what appears to be a modern extension and thus not the original structure, it is considered that their modern appearance and materials would present an elevation to the streetscene which is of an incongruous appearance and which neither preserves nor enhances the listed building.

It is also proposed to replace the front window within the side annexe with a larger window, which is more centrally positioned. It is recognised that the existing window does not reflect the design, alignment or proportions of the tradition windows in the main front elevation and as such does appear somewhat incongruous. However, its modest size minimises its overall visual impact. Notwithstanding this, it is considered that the replacement window design and position is more sympathetic to the existing windows and thus would be an acceptable alteration which would not harm the character of the listed building.

In terms of the other works proposed, namely the replacement of the first and second floors windows in the front elevation with new white, hardwood sash windows and the renewal of the rendering, no objection to these are raised in principle subject to more detailed information to ensure that the finer details are appropriate. However, this could be conditioned.

Having regard to the above it is considered that the proposal would harm the character and appearance of the Grade II Listed Building and would neither preserve nor enhance its architectural quality, character or the historic importance. The development is therefore deemed to be contrary to Policies SW11 and CW1 of the LDP

In reaching the recommendation, the requirements of section 3 and 5 of the Wellbeing of Future Generations (Wales) Act 2015 have been taken into account. The recommendation is in accordance with the Act's sustainable development principle through its contribution towards the Welsh Minister's well-being objective of supporting safe, cohesive and resilient communities.

Accordingly the following recommendation is made:

RECOMMENDATION: BE REFUSED

REASONS:

1. The alterations to the sunroom roof and fenestration, by virtue of their modern appearance and inappropriate materials, would appear incongruous and unsympathetic, which neither preserves nor enhances the character of the listed building. The proposal is therefore considered to be contrary to Planning Policy Wales (Edition 11) and Policies SW11 and CW1 of the Merthyr Tydfil Borough Council Replacement Local Development Plan.

RECOMMENDATION ENDORSED

Director of Neighbourhood Services

PP.

DATE: 17.07.2023