
From: Ross Anthony <ross.anthony@ancientmonumentsociety.org.uk>
Sent: 23 October 2020 15:22
To: Roberts, Huw
Subject: Application Ref. P/20/0234 - Former St Tydfils Hospital, Upper Thomas Street, Merthyr Tydfil CF47 0SJ



Dear Huw Roberts

Re: Former St Tydfils Hospital, Upper Thomas Street, Merthyr Tydfil CF47 0SJ
Application Ref. P/20/0234

Thank you for consulting us on this application. We have reviewed the documents available on your website, and the Ancient Monuments Society **objects** to the demolition of the curtilage listed house.

Suitable justification has been provided for the loss of the curtilage building on the southern boundary, thought to be the former Managers House. It is considered a listed structure itself under the definition for 'listed building' in section 1(5) of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990. Unfortunately its role and historic significance are dismissed in the Heritage Statement (p14) because of 'demolition of the rest of the workhouse buildings on the site, it has lost its wider context and relationship with the principal listed building'. The AMS disputes this claim, rather being one of the only two buildings to remain on the former hospital site, they both have a very important role in interpreting the past use of this site.

Despite the house having suffered fire damage, it was clearly a residence of considerable size and importance, when compared to the neighbouring housing, and based on the one photo provided, it appears to be a fine two storey stone building, rendered to the rear with decorative quoining, with great potential to be reused within the development. We would therefore recommend a more thorough assessment of the building be undertaken with the view to retaining and restoring the building. Given it is to be replaced by a new dwelling, there is no public benefit to be achieved by its loss and its retention wouldn't require any changes to the proposed road layout or setting of the wider scheme.

Further, the loss of a substantial reusable curtilage listed structure is contrary to the guidance paragraph 1.9 of TAN 24 which states "*The public benefit of taking action to reduce carbon emissions, or to adapt to the impact of climate change, should be weighed against any harm to the significance of historic assets*".

I would be grateful if the AMS could be informed of the outcome when this becomes available.

Yours sincerely,
Ross Anthony

Case Work
Ancient Monuments Society
Registered Charity no. 209605

t: +44 (0)20 7236 3934
e: office@ancientmonumentsociety.org.uk
w: ancientmonumentsociety.org.uk
a: St Ann's Vestry Hall, 2 Church Entry, London EC4V 5HB

The Ancient Monuments Society (AMS) is one of the National Amenity Societies and, as such, is a consultee on all Listed Building Consent applications involving an element of demolition as required by the *Listed building applications and decisions (duty to notify National Amenities Societies and the Royal Commission) (Wales) Direction 2017*. The Society also takes an interest in planning applications affecting historic buildings in conservation areas and undesignated heritage. We concern ourselves with historic buildings of all types and ages.