

HERITAGE IMPACT STATEMENT

For the Maintenance Roof Replacement and Repair at 6 Nightingale Street, Abercanaid, Merthyr Tydfil, CF48 1DX



CONTENTS:

Sections Description	Page No.
General	2
Summary of Proposal	2
Assessment of Impact	2
Significance of Heritage Asset	3
Proposed Works Description	3
Justification for Work	4
Justification for the Selection of Materials	5
Conclusion	8
APPENDIX A: Contextual Audit – Current Terrace Existing Roofing & Related Materials (Nos. 1 to 12 Nightingale Street)	9
APPENDIX B: Photographs of Current Terrace Property’s Existing Roofing Arrangement for 1 to 12 Nightingale street	10

Heritage Impact Statement

Maintenance Roof Replacement and Repair at 6 Nightingale Street, Abercanaid, CF48 1DX

GENERAL:

Property Address: 6 Nightingale Street, Abercanaid, Merthyr Tydfil, Cf48 1DX

Listed Building Designation: Grade II Listed, Cadw Ref: BN

Merthyr Tydfil County Borough Council Record Number: 81733

Planning Application Number: P/25/0218

Related Drawings: Refer to the Planning Application P/25/0218 submission for Site Plan drawing, Plans and elevations drawing for Existing and Plans and elevations drawing for Proposed

Applicant: William Wallace, Agent for the submission; Mr Paul Thomas (Utopia Design)

SUMMARY OF PROPOSAL:

This Impact Statement is in support of the planning application P/25/0218 which is for a MAINTENANCE project only. No development of the property is being undertaken. This is certainly NOT a RESTORATION project. It is proposed that the existing roof and associated items would be replaced with 'like for like' materials with no alteration to roof form, size, or appearance. These materials (roof tile materials, fascia boards, guttering and downpipes, etc) have been part of the existing building's infrastructure for 40-50 years, at the best time-frame assessment and this is approximately 25-30% of the entire life-time existence of this building. The main objective of this maintenance work would ensure that the building is maintained adequately in a fit state for habitation which is the primary purpose of this building; it's for habitation by human persons. It is to ensure the preservation of the property's current state, and to maintain the asset for the future.

ASSESSMENT OF IMPACT:

Following is an assessment of the impacts of the proposed roofing works:

Aspect	Impact	Commentary
Architectural Interest	Neutral	Reinstates existing 'like for like' roofing and associated materials; No alteration to form or appearance, and retains the currently established appearance, profiles and detailing of the roof. Some improvements are envisaged with the utilisation of high-quality materials and better construction practices.
Historic Interest	Positive	The proposal repairs damage and deterioration. It prevents further deterioration and sustains the historic overall fabric of the building. Repair of the original chimneys maintains this historic feature into the future. The use of heritage type cast iron effect / style guttering and downpipes positively adds to and increases the historic effect.
Group / Communal Value / Setting	Neutral	Roofing and associated materials consistent with Grade II terrace of properties at 1 to 12 Nightingale Street; Maintains the current established visual uniformity in this terrace. Maintains the established streetscape prevalent in Abercanaid.

Heritage Impact Statement

Maintenance Roof Replacement and Repair at 6 Nightingale Street, Abercanaid, CF48 1DX

SIGNIFICANCE OF HERITAGE ASSET:

General: This property is part of a terraced row of linked residential housing cottages. These properties are all Grade II listed and are grouped from 1 Nightingale Street to 12 Nightingale Street. A public access lane way between numbers 6 and 7 means that these 2 buildings are end of terrace.

Evidential and historic value: The property is part of an early group of industrial housing at Abercanaid. These properties are considered as one of the best surviving groups of early industrial workers' housing in the region. The houses were built between 1852 and 1861, possibly by the Plymouth Iron Company to house workers employed at the Abercanaid Pit and Pentrebach Forge. Hence, the terrace was constructed to house workers employed in the nearby industrial operations during Merthyr Tydfil's period of rapid expansion.

The row is listed for its group value and for its representation of early industrial housing typologies in South Wales. These group of buildings were only Grade II listed in 1975, approximately the same time that the current roofing materials at 6 Nightingale have been in place.

Communal value: The heritage value of No. 6 and its adjoining properties lies in their collective character and consistent proportions; the mostly uniform roofscape, traditional scale, and simplicity of detailing; and their historic association with 19th-century industrial workers' housing in Merthyr Tydfil. The terrace forms part of the streetscape of Abercanaid, illustrating the social and architectural story of the period of original construction and up to current times.

Original construction: The terraced row properties were originally constructed of square rubble stone (front, rear and side at the 4 end of terrace properties), with close-eaved slate roof, stone chimneys and stone end stacks, 2-storeys, double fronted with small-paned sash windows. These materials were locally available at the time of original construction and would at that time have been cheap low-value materials.

Evolution, alteration and summary audit of current roof materials: The terrace row has evolved incrementally, with each house maintaining a broadly consistent exterior appearance despite gradual material replacements, and numerous alterations, even since listing in 1975. In terms of the existing roofs of the 12 listed buildings - currently, 8 of 12 listed houses now have composite slate tiles (7 dark grey/black, 1 reddish-brown). Four have cement tiles (dark brown). Rainwater goods generally are modern PVC or plastic equivalents. Nos. 5 and 12 have recently renewed roofs in composite slate tiles with black PVC fascias, gutters, and downpipes. End-of-terrace houses (Nos. 1, 6, 7, 12) have side wall fascias visible.

PROPOSED WORKS DESCRIPTION:

Overall summary of works:

- This proposed scope is a maintenance and repair scope. Involving removing the existing composite roof tiles, battens, underlay and rainwater disposal system. Replace with new generally like-for-like items, that provides no change to roof pitch, ridge height, or eaves / verge detailing. Existing chimney stacks are to be repaired, above the roofline.

Heritage Impact Statement

Maintenance Roof Replacement and Repair at 6 Nightingale Street, Abercanaid, CF48 1DX

Detailed description of proposed works:

- Replace entire roof covering with new composite slate tiles, closely similar in size, colour, and profile to existing, except that the tiles and ridge tiles selected are of higher quality. Tiles would include some 'vent tiles' to assist with the ventilation of the internal roof void area. New dry ridge system and ridge tiles to be supplied and fitted, including ridge vent tiles.
- New individual dry very capping system to be supplied and fitted to ends of tiles.
- Renew fascias, currently white PVC on side and rear / 'garden-side' elevations, but suggested to change to black, matching existing dimensions and profile. Suggested change to black is in order to co-ordinate with the adjacent property at No. 5 and the other end-of-terrace house at 12 Nightingale Street.
- Replace gutters and downpipes with black PVC of similar heritage style half-round profile guttering and circular section heritage style downpipes.
- Install new breathable membrane 'felt' and treated / tanalised 25mm x 50mm timber battens beneath tile covering. It is envisaged that no change-out would occur to the existing main timber roof support beams, joists and roof plates.
- 2 existing chimneys are to be repaired, repointed and unobtrusively "capped off" at the tops of the 2 chimneys. Existing stone chimney blocks to be reused. Note: the heights of existing chimneys and general outward appearance is to match the existing appearance. New lead flashing to be supplied and fitted to the 2 existing chimneys at the joints with roof tiles.
- All materials and construction work would be supplied and to be constructed and installed using "best industry practises" and to generally comply with the relevant Building Regulations
- Note regarding the cost of the proposed scope of works, this is quoted at £8,000. This high cost is because of the supply of high quality of materials and additional care required in the roof replacement and repair to a Grade II listed property.

JUSTIFICATION FOR WORK:

1. Roof replacement needed due to the age and deteriorated state of the existing roof:

Targeted repairs are no longer viable given the age and condition of the roof. The current composite roof tiles have reached the end of their operational life cycle (now 'worn-out').

A survey by the roofing contractor was conducted in June 2025, where the surveyor estimates that the vintage of the current roof is approximately 1970's. This is impossible to check, due to lack of historic records and the fact that the property has changed owners 3 or possibly 4 times during that period of 50 years. The older style 'composite slate tiles' comprising the current roof, in addition to the wear inflicted by 50 years, shows damage to edges of various tiles and some of the fixings are also either very worn or missing.

Heritage Impact Statement

Maintenance Roof Replacement and Repair at 6 Nightingale Street, Abercanaid, CF48 1DX

Also, in terms of 1970's or even 1980's vintage composite slate tiles lifespan, the expected replacement point of the current tiles has been reached, a website explanation is quoted as following. According to the "Garlock-french.com" website which states "*composite slates (or shingles) can last between 40 and 50 years. Regardless of the materials, a roof's lifespan depends on regular maintenance, adequate attic ventilation, and proper roof installation*". This is independent proof that the lifespan of the current composite slates has been reached.

Hence the conclusion is that the entire roof and associated items need to be replaced.

2. To alleviate current, probable water ingress: Water ingress to the interior of the building and the build-up of condensation inside the roof void area, has become evident, due the dilapidated state of the existing roof, and the internal felt layer (now hanging loose) and chimneys being in need of repair. The water ingress mainly appears to be around the lane-side area of the roof and the chimney at that end of the roof.

3. To ensure that the chimneys are repaired to sound condition: Currently the pointing at both chimneys is deteriorated and degraded. Neither chimney is in operational use and water ingress to the interior of the chimney jointly owned with 5 Nightingale shows water ingress to the interior. Hence the chimneys need to be repaired with new pointing and new lead flashing at the joints with the roof tiles. To ensure that water ingress to the interior of the chimneys does not continue these need to be capped in a manner that would not be visible from street level.

4. To ensure the adequate protection of the main fabric of the building: The main fabric and visible aspect of the building is the original rubble stone walls and associated exterior stone windowsills, lintels and the chimneys, comprising approximately 80-85% of the building. The roof replacement is therefore to ensure and preserve the inherent current state of the property, so that it is maintained for the current time and into the future. Also, the roof replacement ensures the fit state of the building for human habitation which is the continuing major purpose of the building.

JUSTIFICATION FOR THE SELECTION OF MATERIALS:

Justification 1. No change in 'Like for like' replacement: The selection of the proposed materials in composite slate tiles, PVC rainwater goods and fascias reflects the existing materials ensuring no material change. This matching of tile size, coursing, colouring, profiles and dimensions ensures that the new proposed materials match the existing roof's arrangements. It will also cohere with other Listed buildings on the street.

Justification 2. Consistency with the roof materials at other Grade II listed properties at 1 to 12 Nightingale Street: As stated previously and as further evidenced in the attached Appendix A, the roof materials at other properties in the terrace are either composite slate tiles or cement tiles. The rainwater disposal system materials are white or black PVC, mostly half-round guttering, but one property has Ogee form guttering. Downpipes are mainly 'standard' circular section black PVC downpipes, but one property has white PVC square section style. The exception is at one property, (No. 11) where the down pipe at the front / street-side is an uncoated metal that appears to be aluminium. The majority of fascia materials are consistently white or black PVC. By maintaining the same proposed 'like for like' roofing tiles, guttering, downpipes and fascia materials ensures the consistency of the majority of the terrace roofs is maintained.

Heritage Impact Statement

Maintenance Roof Replacement and Repair at 6 Nightingale Street, Abercanaid, CF48 1DX

Additionally, the Applicant also notes that the roof, guttering and fascia at the front / street-side of 77 Nightingale Street (diametrically opposite and across the street to 5 Nightingale), has recently, within the past three months been repaired and or replaced at the front / street-side of the building, where old composite slate tiles have been replaced with new composite slate tiles and PVC fascia and rainwater works. This is also in keeping with the same 'like for like' modern roofing materials and it maintains the current streetscape. The Applicant presumes that Grade II planning permission would have been granted for this work.

Justification 3. Chimneys remaining 'in-situ': The 2 chimneys at 6 Nightingale are non-operational. These have been internally modified prior to the purchase of this property by the current owners. The chimney at the lane end is entirely gone internally, whilst the internal chimney breast at the party wall with 5 Nightingale remains, but the fireplace opening had been blocked-off / boarded-off. However, the 2 chimney stacks extending above the roofline are to remain (proposed) and be repaired with new mortar pointing and stonework as required to maintain the historic heritage value of the chimneys and to maintain the current skyline / roofline.

4. Comparison with other roofing materials:

Other materials than those proposed were evaluated and compared for the roofing tiles, guttering and down pipes, etc prior to settling on the selected proposed materials. The following is the justification of the selected materials and an assay of those not selected:

A. Roofing Tiles:

Cement tiles: Cement roofing tiles in various styles, including Double Roman and Ludlow Major, Plain (interlocked) tiles, Modern, Pantiles, and Profiled tiles were examined. These were discounted because they bear no physical resemblance to slates or composite slate tiles (even though four properties in the 1 to 12 Nightingale terrace have installed these profiled-type cement tiles currently).

Slate tiles: Natural slate tiles have some advantages over other tile types. However, for this like for like maintenance project the consideration of natural slate material also has some serious disadvantages. Firstly, natural slate (particularly Welsh slate being much thicker than the imported varieties) has a considerable heavier weight impact, which is likely to require stronger, and probably additional, more expensive, internal structural support / reinforcement. This would mean that the existing roof structure would have to be evaluated and additional main roof structure support / reinforcing timber be installed. It might also require additional skilled labour for the installation component of natural slate tiles. It might also necessitate changing the roof line. Lastly, natural slate tiles are considerably more expensive than composite slate, with material costs ranging upwards from 3 to 4 times the cost for composite slate tiles, moving it beyond the scope of work envisaged or affordable.

Justification for proposed use of reproduction composite slate tiles: This tile type simulates, realistically natural slate, whilst still providing with the use of good quality composite tiles, a visually aesthetically pleasing roof vista. Composite slate tiles are utilised generally for projects with tighter budgets or where the specific aesthetic is needed without the much higher cost of the natural product. High-quality, readily available reproduction slates would be used for this proposed maintenance project, matching as close as possible to the colour and form of the

Heritage Impact Statement

Maintenance Roof Replacement and Repair at 6 Nightingale Street, Abercanaid, CF48 1DX

natural product. The look of high-quality composite slate tiles is often as good as the natural product, meaning that the opinion of an industry expert is often required to tell apart the composite tiles against the natural slates. Additionally, if repair is needed in the future, then replacement composite tiles remain readily available and in the same product range, matching existing composite tiles. Whereas this is often not the case with natural slate, where batches of one set of natural slates are difficult to match in colour and texture (and often even edge finish), to subsequent batches, hence creating tile differences after replacement.

The Applicant also notes that the proposed use of composite slate tiles matches with the existing roofs at other properties in the adjoining terraced row where 8 properties have previously installed composite slate tiles. Hence, currently a major precedent for the installation of composite slate tiles has been established. The Applicant notes that the property at 12 Nightingale Street has undergone a recent roof replacement and the good quality of the composite slates and the good quality of installation has provided an aesthetically satisfying and traditional looking finished project.

On a cost-benefit analysis of composite slate versus natural slate, the composite clearly wins. The very minor incremental 'look' advantage of Welsh natural slate is simply overpowered by the dramatic high-cost disadvantage, taking it beyond the affordability of current residents or landlords. With the proposed selection of high-quality composite slate tiles, a very comparable natural and traditional look will be achieved and consequently justifies their selection.

B. Guttering and downpipes:

Cast iron guttering and downpipes were evaluated. However, the major disadvantages included their heavy weight meaning additional support internal timber structures would be required at the inside of the fascia interface. The 2nd major disadvantage is that cast iron is prone to hairline cracking and corrosion and rust, creating constant maintenance issues, unsightly appearance and the need to have the exterior surfaces repeatedly cleaned up and repainted. The 3rd major disadvantage is the upfront cost of a cast iron system which is between 3 and 5 times the cost of the selected heritage style PVC materials with high costs for installation for cast iron. The 4th major disadvantage is that cast iron is inconsistent / incongruent with the rainwater works currently installed at all the other properties in the terrace.

Justification for the selected / proposed PVC material in cast iron style / effect rainwater system (Brett Martin's Cascade range), comprising half round guttering and circular downpipes is relatively inexpensive and lightweight and an easily maintained gutter style that replicates the aesthetics of traditional cast iron gutters and downpipes. Cast iron style / effect gutters don't rust or corrode and repairs are generally inexpensive compared to genuine cast iron. Also, the half round guttering profile is the same as the existing guttering installed at 5 Nightingale property and hence matching and joining of the new proposed guttering and the existing guttering at these 2 properties would be easily completed. Therefore, this selection has numerous advantages without the major disadvantages of cast iron. A slight inconsistency would result to the remainder of the listed terrace properties, where mainly black standard PVC materials have been used. But this is offset because the selected cast iron style / effect rainwater system simulates the cast iron, traditional looking character of guttering and downpipes.

Heritage Impact Statement

Maintenance Roof Replacement and Repair at 6 Nightingale Street, Abercanaid, CF48 1DX

C. Fascia boards:

Various composite or timber fascia materials were examined. These were discounted because the introduction of a new fascia style material would be incongruous with the majority of the fascias at the grade terraced group where black or white PVC fascias panels are by majority, currently installed.

It is noted in a comment from HB&P (forwarded to the Applicant by MT planning's Marlene Ferreira), that states *"The adjacent listed building at no 7 has used uPVC fascia boards and this is clearly an anachronistic and detracting appearance to the historic character of that building"*. Having visited the actual Nightingale Street listed terrace properties, the Applicant would generally agree with that comment. However, the Applicant disagrees that the fault of the apparent ugliness of the currently installed fascia panels at 7 Nightingale, lies with the materials selection of PVC fascia. The 'ugliness' fault is the resultant of very poor fascia panels installation practises and shoddy installation workmanship, particularly apparent at the end of terrace (lane) side of the building. At that side white fascia panels have been installed in a very shoddy and incomplete fashion, and they don't match with the fascia panels at the front / street-side of the property, nor are they joined at the corner of the building. HB&P, quoting this one example in isolation seems an unfairness, to the selection of PVC fascia material. Whereas, at 12 Nightingale Street the fascias at side, front and back appear as a cohesive, good quality and complete installation and the aesthetic value is a vast improvement compared to the No. 7 property. The contractor for the proposed works at 6 Nightingale will complete a high-quality installation of the proposed fascia panels ensuring they are all joined property and this will provide an adequate visual and aesthetic aspect.

Justification for the selected / proposed PVC fascia material: PVC fascia boards are proposed due to their durability and low maintenance requirements. They're resistant to rot, warping, and weather damage, and require minimal upkeep. They can last for 20 to 30 years. They also have ease of installation to existing internal rafters / support timbers. Consistency with the other listed properties in the terrace was also a main consideration, where 9 of the 12 buildings currently have white or black PVC fascia materials installed, hence the selected material and form is basically consistent with other terraced properties. The PVC fascia in black colour would match into and join seamlessly with the existing fascia panels at the adjoining property; 5 Nightingale Street.

CONCLUSION:

The proposed works are necessary, essential maintenance, not development nor alteration. They are like-for-like replacements that secure the building's continued use and structural integrity, preserve the terrace's evolved and established architectural rhythm and mostly visual coherence, and cause no harm to the special architectural or historic interest of the listed property. The building's significance for human habitation will be maintained and its contribution to the terrace and wider streetscape are sustained. Accordingly, this proposal has attempted to consistently comply with and to apply the principles per Planning Policy Wales (Edition 12), Technical Advice Note 24: The Historic Environment, and Cadw's Conservation Principles (2011).

Heritage Impact Statement

Maintenance Roof Replacement and Repair at 6 Nightingale Street, Abercanaid, CF48 1DX

APPENDIX A:

Contextual Audit for Current Terrace Existing Roofing Materials (Nos. 1 to 12 Nightingale Street)

Property No.	Roof Tiles Material	Fascia Material	Guttering Material	Downpipe Material
1	Brown profiled Cement tiles	White PVC (front/side/back)	White Ogee form PVC	White square section PVC
2	Brown profiled Cement tiles	Black PVC	Black PVC (metal lower)	None
3	Grey Composite slate tiles	White timber	Black half-round PVC	Black circular PVC
4	Black Composite slate tiles	White timber	Black half-round PVC	None
5	Grey Composite slate tiles	Black PVC	Black half-round PVC	Black circular PVC
6	Grey Composite slate tiles (existing)	White PVC (front/side/back)	Black half-round PVC	Black circular PVC
7	Brown profiled Cement tiles	White PVC	Black half-round PVC	None
8	Grey Composite slate tiles	White PVC	Black half-round PVC	Black circular PVC
9	Grey Composite slate tiles	White PVC	Black half-round PVC	Black PVC
10	Redish Brown Composite slate tiles	Brown or discoloured timber	Black half-round PVC	None
11	Brown profiled Cement tiles	Black PVC	Black half-round PVC	Circular Metal - silver colour
12	Dark-grey Composite slate tiles	Black PVC (front/side/back)	Black half-round PVC	Black circular PVC

Notes:

- The 'audit table' above compares only the properties roofs at the front / street side of the properties.
- Materials included above for 6 Nightingale are the current / existing materials at the time of formulation of this Impact Statement.
- The Audit Table above proves that the precedence has been set already for the installation and use of composite slate tiles roofing materials, these being the dominant roof tile materials currently installed.

Heritage Impact Statement

Maintenance Roof Replacement and Repair at 6 Nightingale Street, Abercanaid, CF48 1DX

APPENDIX B:

Photographs of Current Terrace Property's Existing Roofing Arrangement for 1 to 12 Nightingale Street

Photograph 1: Street side façade view; 6 Nightingale (at left of pic). Right side of pic is corner of 7 Nightingale, where the shoddy installation of fascia panels creates an aesthetically 'ugly' result.



Photograph 2: Street side view of facades and rooflines of 1 to 6 Nightingale Street.



Heritage Impact Statement

Maintenance Roof Replacement and Repair at 6 Nightingale Street, Abercanaid, CF48 1DX

Photograph 3: Street side view of the front façade and recent new roof, fascia panels and rainwater system of 12 Nightingale. An example of good quality roof materials and installation.



Photograph 4: Street side view, facades and roof lines of 7 to 12 Nightingale Street

