

DELEGATED REPORT

Application No: P/24/0266

Site Address: Nant Y Gweunydd
Heolgerrig
Merthyr Tydfil
CF48 1TD

Development: Proposed front and rear dormers

Case Officer: Kate Glover

Site Visit: 4th December 2024

Application Expiry Date: 28th January 2025

Consultation reply date expired: 25 December 2024

APPLICATION SITE

The application site relates to a detached bungalow with living accommodation in the roof. The bungalow has the benefit of a parking area at the front and rear garden. The external materials comprise of rendered elevations, upVC window frames and doors and grey coloured concrete roof tiles.

The site is in a predominantly residential area and the dwellings directly adjacent to the site are Arfryn (east) and Leafy Lodge (west). The site is seen in association with the identified dwellings and create a small group of bungalows, further to this the open aspect of the surrounding area results in the site being observed from public areas, particularly views from the east and south. No. 4 Jones terrace (north) is also directly adjacent to the site, however due to the topography, No.4 occupies a much lower level and the property's roof is observed from the site.

The character and appearance of the dwellings which comprise the street scene of which the site is a part, are a mix of design, scale and materials. While a few properties to the west of the site incorporate gable elements, the roofscape is predominantly simple pitched roofs, some of which may be the subject of modest alteration through the insertion of rooflights.

The application site is within the settlement boundary as identified by Local Development Plan Policy SW4.

PROPOSED DEVELOPMENT

This application seeks full permission to insert 2 No. pitch roofed, dormer windows into the front roof pitch and 4 No. dormers into the rear roof pitch. The rear dormer windows require planning permission due to the removal of permitted development rights under the property's original planning permission.

The proposed front dormers would be identical in size and materials. Each dormer would measure approximately 2.67m in width and would project off the roof by a maximum depth of approximately 3.44m, and each dormer would be positioned approximately 1.52m above the eaves of the property and approximately 0.32mm below the ridge. These dormers would serve bedrooms.

The rear dormers to be inserted into the rear roof pitch would be of two designs and comprise of two large dormers incorporating Juliet balconies and two smaller dormers. The large dormers would be located near the sides of the roof pitch and each dormer would measure approximately 2.06m in width and would project off the roof by a maximum depth of approximately 4.78m, the foot of each dormer would be positioned slightly below eaves level and approximately 0.32mm below the ridge. The smaller dormers would be located on the area of roof between the large dormers and each dormer would measure approximately 2.09m in width and would project off the roof by a maximum depth of approximately 2.20m, and each dormer would be positioned approximately 0.70m above the eaves of the property and approximately 0.47mm below the ridge. The large dormers would serve bedrooms and the small dormers would serve bathrooms.

The materials proposed to be used on the exterior of the dormers would match those used on the existing dwelling.

PLANNING HISTORY

The relevant planning history is summarised below:

P/16/0236 Erection of two detached bungalows with detached garages and associated access works GRANTED on 21 September 2016

Condition 11 states:

“Notwithstanding the provisions of schedule 2, part 1, classes A, B, C and E of the Town and Country Planning (General Permitted Development) Order 1995 (as amended for Wales) (or any order revoking and re-enacting that order with or without modification), no extensions, roof alterations, buildings or raised platforms shall be erected other than those expressly authorised by this permission.

Reason - *In the interest of visual amenity in accordance with Policy BW7 of the Merthyr Tydfil Local Development Plan”.*

CONSULTATION

Consultations were not carried out as part of this application.

PUBLICITY

In accordance with the Town & Country Planning (Development Management Procedure) (Wales) Order 2012, letters were sent to adjoining properties and a site notice was displayed within the vicinity of the site.

No letters of objection were received following this publicity exercise.

POLICY CONTEXT

National Development Framework

Future Wales: the National Plan 2040 (February 2021) (Future Wales) sets out a strategy for addressing key national priorities through the planning system, including sustaining and developing a vibrant economy, achieving decarbonisation and climate-resilience, developing strong ecosystems and improving the health and well-being of our communities.

National Planning Policies

Planning Policy Wales (Edition 12, February 2024) (PPW12).
Technical Advice Note 12: Design (March 2016) (TAN12)

Local Planning Policies

The following policies of the Merthyr Tydfil County Borough Council Replacement Local Development Plan 2016-2031 (LDP) are relevant to the determination of this application:

- SW4 Settlement Boundaries
- SW11 Sustainable Design and Placemaking
- EnW1 Nature Conservation and Ecosystem Resilience
- EnW3 Regionally Important Geological Sites, Sites of Importance for Nature Conservation, Local Nature Reserves and Priority Habitats and Species

In addition, the application will be determined having regard to the advice contained within the following Supplementary Planning Guidance (SPG) Notes:

- Note 4, Sustainable Design
- Note 5, Nature and Development
- Note 6, A Design Guide for Householder Development

PLANNING CONSIDERATIONS

The issues to consider under the assessment of this application relate to whether the proposed front and rear dormer windows, would be an acceptable form of development with regards to its visual impact upon the character and appearance of the property and the street scene, impact upon the residential amenity of neighbouring dwellings and ecology.

Principle of Development

The site relates to a detached dwelling located in a mainly residential area within the settlement boundaries. Accordingly, the principle of development is considered to be acceptable subject to compliance with other planning policies and material planning considerations.

Visual Impact

As noted above, the proposal includes the erection of two dormer windows within the front roof slope on the principal elevation of the dwelling and the dormers would be highly noticeable on the property itself and within the wider streetscene.

When viewed in isolation, the size, design and position of the front dormers might be sympathetic to the character of the dwelling and their position on the roof is in line with the windows below. However, the property is clearly visible within the streetscene and it is noted that dormer windows are not a feature characteristic of the dwellings in the immediate vicinity of the site. Furthermore, when viewed from public vantage points, the application property and the adjacent bungalows are a small group of dwellings with strong similarities in terms of their character and appearance.

Turning to the rear dormers. Permitted development rights in respect of alterations to the roof have been removed from the property and that of Leafy Lodge which was granted consent under the same planning permission. The removal of rights is in the interest of visual amenity. Whilst the proposed rear dormers would require planning permission because the bottom of the large dormers are within 20cm of the bottom of the roof, this point in relation to the need for planning permission, is minor when making an assessment in the overall design and impact of the dormers. Indeed, the front and side elevations of Leafy Lodge are highly visible in the street and, therefore, alterations would be clearly seen, whereas the application site's rear elevation is not clearly visible from public vantage points. In respect of the proposed dormers their pitched roofed design, size, scale and overall appearance would not detract from the character and appearance of the property or wider street scene.

As such, the proposed dormer windows on roof slope of the principal elevation, would significantly alter the character of the property and result in a property which is visually discordant within the streetscene. Consequently, it would harm the character and appearance of the dwelling itself and the wider area contrary to Policy SW11 and SPG Note 6.

Impact on Residential Amenity

Given the positioning of the property and its relationship with neighbouring dwellings, the front and rear dormer windows would not have an overbearing or a significant level of overshadowing impact on these properties.

Turning to the detriment to residential amenity in respect of increases in overlooking and loss of privacy. It is noted that the dormer windows proposed, is to be set into the front elevation are approximately 32m distant from 1 Crud Yr Awel, which is the property directly opposite the site. Given the separation distance involved, the proposed front dormer windows would not, therefore, cause any significant loss of privacy.

As noted above, the rear dormers comprise of two larger dormers with Juliet balconies which would be positioned near the edges of the sides of the roof, and two

smaller dormer windows which sit centrally in the roof. The proposed dormers would not directly overlook the neighbouring dwelling Arfyn, (east) and whilst there may be a degree of overlooking into part of Arfyn's private garden area, this area is a small part of the overall garden and is somewhat obscured by several trees. In respect of Leafy Lodge (west), there may be a degree of overlooking into the front garden, the area of garden that is affected is also small and less private as it is at the front of the propriety. As such the proposal would not result in a significant degree of overlooking.

With respect to the 4 Jones Terrace (north), it is acknowledged that this property occupies a much lower level, with a blank gable elevation facing towards the site. Views from the proposed dormer windows would therefore be partially across the front garden and onto a blank wall, which would not result in any harm. In terms of impact on the rear garden area, the proposed dormer windows would mainly be obscured by the boundary fence between the application site and 4 Jones Terrace. However, the roof of the application property becomes visible towards the end of No. 4's private garden, and it would be possible to see the large dormer and the windows of the small dormer which would be positioned towards the eastern end of the roof. There is a separation distance of approximately 28m between the site and the part of No. 4s garden where the development would be observed. The other dormer windows, those positioned on the west side of the roof pitch, would be obscured by the garage associated with Leafy Lodge. It is also noted that the rear windows which are positioned in 3 Jones Terrace directly over look the rear area of No.4's garden. On balance given the separation distance involved and that there is overlooking from a direct neighbour, the increase in overlooking experienced by of No.4 as a result of the proposal, would not be so significant to warrant a reason for refusal in this instance.

It is also noted that no representations were received following the publicity exercise.

Accordingly, the proposal meets the requirements of LDP Policy SW11.

Ecology

The Council's Ecologist advises that there is no requirement for any ecological survey to be submitted in support of the proposal, however ecological enhancements are required.

As noted in chapter 6 of Planning Policy Wales (edition 12), applications should be supported by Green Infrastructure Statements (GIS). Given the nature of development, that no green infrastructure would be affected by the proposal, and the advice of the, this requirement would not be deemed a reasonable requirement in this instance.

The Local Planning Authority's have a duty to take action towards securing the maintenance and enhancement of the afore mentioned features and to mitigate against the effects of climate change, as no enhancement is proposed it is considered that the proposed development is contrary to national planning policy. The Dear CPO Letter of 2019 is clear that "...where biodiversity enhancement is not proposed as part of an application, significant weight will be given to its absence,

and unless other significant material considerations indicate otherwise it will be necessary to refuse permission.”

As no biodiversity enhancement has been proposed as part of the development, the proposal fails to meet with the requirements of LDP Policies EnW1 and EnW3.

Conclusion

The duty to improve the economic, social, environmental and cultural well-being of Wales, in accordance with the sustainable development principle, under section 3 of the Well-Being of Future Generations (Wales) Act 2015 (“the WBFG Act”) has been taken into consideration when determining this application. In reaching the following recommendation, the ways of working set out at section 5 of the WBFG Act have been considered and thus the proposal is in accordance with the sustainable development principle through its contribution towards one or more of the Welsh Ministers well-being objectives set out as required by section 8 of the WBFG Act.

Having regard to the policy context above, the proposal is not acceptable and the following recommendation is made:

RECOMMENDATION: BE REFUSED for the following **REASONS:**

1. The proposed dormer windows located in the front roof pitch would introduce an incongruous feature into the roofscape and wider street scene and harm the overall character and appearance street scene. As such the proposal is contrary to Policy SW11 of the Merthyr Tydfil County Borough Council Replacement Local Development Plan.
2. The application has not demonstrated a net benefit in respect of biodiversity contrary to Policy EnW1 and Policy EnW3 of the Merthyr Tydfil Replacement Local Development Plan, Planning Policy Wales 12 and The Environment (Wales) Act 2016.

RECOMMENDATION ENDORSED



Director of Neighbourhood Services

DATE: 27.01.2025

