

DELEGATED REPORT

Application No:	P/24/0042
Site Address:	2 Quay Row Abercanaid Merthyr Tydfil CF48 1YP
Development:	Remove two chimneys from listed building
Case Officer:	Adam Foote
Site Visit:	11th March 2024
Application Expiry Date:	23rd April 2024
Consultation reply date expired:	4th April 2024

APPLICATION SITE

The application site comprises a Grade II listed residential dwelling known as “2 Quay Row” (listing reference 11496), the property forms the end of a terrace of residential dwellings with the end 4 properties (including No 2) being listed. Previously No 1 and 2 Quay Row have been combined, the listing covers the building in its entirety. Quay Row separates the Grade II listed Upper Abercanaid House (listing reference 11494) and the former Glamorganshire canal. The reason for listing is cited as, “Included as one of the best surviving groups of early industrial workers' housing in the region”. The list description reads as;

“No 2 is whitewashed with slate roof, small red brick left end stack to former No 1 and red brick stack at left of former No 2. No 1 has a very small window to first floor left and a ground floor right window in stucco surround with C20 aluminium glazing. Rubble stone left end wall. The original No 2 has 2 narrow 4-pane sashes above 2 wider windows with C20 aluminium glazing and centre ledged door. All openings have stucco surrounds with minimal pediments, door surround with keystone”.

The site is within the settlement boundary as identified by Local Development Plan Policy SW4 and its associated proposals map and is within the Merthyr Tydfil Landscape of Outstanding Historic Interest.

SITE SETTING

The application site is set off the nearby estate roads at the edge of a pocket of residential dwellings. Quay Row faces the former Glamorganshire Canal at the edge of the settlement away from the closest residential dwellings and makes a strong and positive visual contribution to the character and amenity of the area. Given its position at the end of the row No 2 is visually prominent when travelling both north and south along Lewis Square which forms part of the Taff Trail, a very well used active travel link.

PROPOSED DEVELOPMENT

This application seeks Listed Building consent for the removal of both chimney stacks from the property with the reason cited being that they are in poor condition and causing damp/water ingress to the property. The proposal includes making good of the roof and finishing it in slate tiles to match the existing roof slopes. Full details of the proposed works are shown on the submitted plans which accompany this application.

PLANNING HISTORY

P/10/0149	Replacement of existing softwood windows with white double glazed UPVC windows	REFUSED
P/22/0063	New timber windows and doors to front and rear elevation	APPROVED

CONSULTATION

Planning Ecologist - Survey Works Required

PUBLICITY

In accordance with the Town & Country Planning (Development Management Procedure) (Wales) Order 2012, letters were sent to neighbouring properties, site notices were displayed within the vicinity of the site and a notice advertised in a local newspaper. No representations were received as a result of this publicity exercise.

POLICY CONTEXT

National Policy

Future Wales: The National Plan 2040 (2021)
Planning Policy Wales (12th Ed, 2024)
The Planning (Listed Building and Conservation Areas) Act 1990
Historic Environment (Wales) Act 2016
Technical Advice Note 12: Design
Technical Advice Note 24: Historic Environment
Well-being of Future Generations (Wales) Act 2015

Local planning policy

Merthyr Tydfil County Borough Council Replacement Local Development Plan (LDP) 2016-2031:

Policy SW11 - Sustainable Design and Placemaking
Policy CW1 - Historic Environment
Policy EnW1 - Nature Conservation and Ecosystem Resilience

KEY CONSIDERATIONS

Need for development

The justification provided for the proposed development is that the chimney stacks are in a poor state of repair and are allowing water ingress resulting in damp within the property. This is not considered to be a robust justification for the permanent removal of the chimney stacks or any other features that positively contribute to the appearance and character of the property. Maintenance/upkeep is expected in all buildings and whilst repair works would be supported the removal of the stacks in their entirety are not. The stacks are mentioned within the list description and make an undeniable positive contribution to the character and appearance of the building by providing breaks and visual interest within the roof scape. When applying the preserve or enhance test to the proposed development it has not been possible to satisfy this requirement as the removal of the stacks result in a detrimental visual impact that detracts from the character of the property.

Visual Impact

As previously stated, the proposed development site is readily visible within the public realm and makes a positive contribution to the character and appearance of the area. It would be expected that properties of this age would have chimney stacks and although the stacks in situ today may not be original they are undoubtedly of a significant age and their presence, finish and construction positively contributes to the visual impact and character of the property and to the row as a whole.

PPW states (6.1.10) *“There should be a general presumption in favour of the preservation or enhancement of a listed building and its setting, which might extend beyond its curtilage. For any development proposal affecting a listed building or its setting, the primary material consideration is the building, its setting or any features of special architectural or historic interest which it possesses”*. In this instance the chimney stacks are considered to be features of special architectural or historic interest which should be preserved. Although in their current state they allow for water ingress it is considered this issue could be easily remedied to allow for their retention without resulting in any harm to the fabric of the building.

Given their relationship to one another and siting, the row is viewed as a group, this is reflected within the reason for listing (Included as one of the best surviving groups of early industrial workers housing in the region). Therefore, any detrimental impact is considered to have a wider reaching level of harm as it will not just impact one property.

The Heritage Impact Statement (HIS) that accompanies this application claims that the previously completed works to other properties within the row (including removal of chimney stacks) has diminished the value of the group and justifies a less strict approach. The removal of other chimney stacks along the row has been cited within the HIS as further justification and argues that the removal of the stacks from No 2 would then result in a greater level of uniformity along the row therefore reinstating their value as a group. This view is not shared by the Local Planning Authority (LPA) who have not issued consent for the removal of chimney stacks along the row and has taken a consistent approach when dealing with applications for Quay Row insisting upon the use of traditional materials to ensure the cumulative value is preserved.

Ecology

Given the nature of the proposed works, the age, position and condition of the stacks/roof and nearby ecological features the Planning Ecologist has identified a need for survey works to support the proposed development. No survey works have been submitted in support of the development and none have been requested as the proposal is not considered to be acceptable in principle therefore it would be unreasonable to request survey works to support a development that is not to be supported.

Should the proposal be considered acceptable in principle additional survey works would be required to demonstrate that the works would not have any unacceptable adverse impact upon ecology or biodiversity. As these details are required and do not form part of the submission it is considered necessary to refuse the application on these grounds, this is consistent with the guidance within the Dear Chief Planning Officer Letter of 2019 "...where biodiversity enhancement is not proposed as part of an application, significant weight will be given to its absence, and unless other significant material considerations indicate otherwise it will be necessary to refuse permission."

CONCLUSION

The justification for the proposed removal of the chimneys is not considered to be sufficient to warrant the permanent removal of both chimney stacks. It is expected that a level of maintenance and repairs would be required for all buildings and that with the appropriate level of repair works the issue of water ingress could be resolved allowing the chimney stacks to remain in situ without any adverse impact upon the fabric of the building. The removal of the stacks would result in an adverse visual impact that detracts from the character and appearance of not only No 2 but the wider Quay Row, therefore the proposed development has failed to satisfy the preserve or enhance test. For the above reasons, the proposal is considered to conflict with the Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas Act 1990 and with Planning Policy Wales 12 and policies SW11 and CW1 of the LDP. Additionally the proposal has not demonstrated that there would not be any unacceptable impact upon ecology/biodiversity nor has a Green Infrastructure Statement or scheme providing a net benefit for biodiversity been provided. Accordingly, the following recommendation is made:

RECOMMENDATION: BE REFUSED for the following REASONS

1. The proposed development would result in a detrimental visual impact that would fail to preserve or enhance the character or appearance of the Listed Building contrary to the requirements of Planning Policy Wales 12, Historic Environment (Wales) Act 2016, The Planning (Listed Building and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 and Policies SW11 (1) and CW1 of the Merthyr Tydfil County Borough Council Replacement Local Development Plan
2. The proposed development has failed to demonstrate that there would be no unacceptable adverse impact upon ecology, biodiversity or European Protected Species by virtue of the absence of appropriate level of ecological survey and appropriate mitigation contrary to Policy EnW1 of the Merthyr Tydfil County Borough Council Replacement Local Development Plan.

RECOMMENDATION ENDORSED


Director of Neighbourhood Services

PP

DATE: 12.04.2024